

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC<br/>REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS<br/>LIABILITY LITIGATION</b> | <b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327<br/>MDL No. 2327</b> |
| <b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO<br/>THE CASES ON THE EXHIBIT<br/>ATTACHED HERETO</b>        | <b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN<br/>U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>      |

**JOINT MOTION TO DISMISS WITHOUT PREJUDICE**

Plaintiffs, whose cases are listed on the attached Exhibit A, and Defendants, Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc., and/or Ethicon LLC (collectively, the “Ethicon Defendants”), jointly move to dismiss without prejudice all claims against the Ethicon Defendants, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2). No other defendants remain. Therefore, the Ethicon Defendants respectfully request the Court close this case and strike it from the docket. Each party shall bear her or its own costs.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Caroline L. Maida  
Caroline L. Maida  
The Mostyn Law Firm  
3810 West Alabama Street  
Houston, Texas 77027  
(713) 861-6616  
clmaida@mostynlaw.com  
*Counsel for Plaintiffs*

/s/ William M. Gage  
William M. Gage (MS Bar #8691)  
Butler Snow LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
(601) 985-4561  
william.gage@butlersnow.com

/s/ Susan M. Robinson  
Susan M. Robinson (W. Va. Bar #5169)  
Thomas Combs & Spann PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 24338

(304) 414-1800  
srobinson@tcspllc.com  
*Counsel for the Ethicon Defendants*

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on this date I electronically filed this document with the clerk of the court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of this filing to CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ William M. Gage

**EXHIBIT A**  
**(The Mostyn Law Firm)**

| <b>Civil Action No.</b> | <b>Case Style</b>   |
|-------------------------|---|
| 2:13-cv-30822           | Sally Lang and Richard Malone Lang v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:13-cv-31085           | Janie Karen Hudson v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                       |
| 2:13-cv-33467           | Lydia Amado v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:13-cv-33709           | Joyce Livingston v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                         |
| 2:13-cv-33880           | Sharon Pottier and Gerald Pottier v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:13-cv-33886           | Shawn Puckett and Christopher Puckett v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson    |
| 2:13-cv-33904           | Linda Marie Royce and Gary A. Royce, Sr. v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:13-cv-33922           | Heather L. Schmidt v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                       |
| 2:13-cv-33996           | Emily F. Wacker v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                         |
| 2:13-cv-34008           | Joyce White and Orville Pollard v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson         |
| 2:14-cv-00073           | Helen Adams and James Adams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:14-cv-00078           | Robin Rae Caudill and Arthur McKinney v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:14-cv-00080           | Donna Rae Cavaness v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:14-cv-05918           | Barbara E. Gibson and Jimmy Gibson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson      |
| 2:14-cv-11060           | Teresa Diane Bryars and Charles Bryars v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:14-cv-11070           | Tamara Estes v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:14-cv-11071           | Marilyn Fleming and Vince Fleming v. Ethicon, Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:14-cv-11357           | Leslie A. LaParr and Dale Elmer LaParr v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:14-cv-12292           | Hilary Harris and Anthony Harris v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                      |
| 2:14-cv-12371           | Betty Rounds v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:14-cv-12381           | Rosemary Ventura-Parris v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:14-cv-12429           | Lona Cramer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:14-cv-12749           | Linda Carol Conley v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                    |
| 2:14-cv-12776           | Janie Davis Marunich and Sanfert Marunich v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:14-cv-12798           | Margaret Giles, deceased, and Teresa Robinette v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:14-cv-13030           | Naomi Schenk v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:14-cv-13046           | Tina M. Stratton v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:14-cv-13611           | Renee Putnam v. Ethicon Inc.; Ethicon, LLC; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:14-cv-13896           | Sheila Rae Webb v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:14-cv-18382           | Shirley Mae Pilkington and Jimmy Pilkington v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:14-cv-18424           | Minnie Sharnell Williams v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:14-cv-18465           | Opal J. Litras and Henry Johnson v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                        |

|               |  |
|---------------|--|
| 2:14-cv-21927 | Betty Lou Davis v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:14-cv-22294 | Kimberly Howell v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:14-cv-22318 | Celia Candida Savage and John T. Savage v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:14-cv-22357 | Kay F. Willetts and Walter Willetts v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:14-cv-22885 | Cynthia F. Sade-Ehrgott and Michael J. Ehrgott v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:14-cv-22906 | Vasfie Hoxha and Besnik Hoxha v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:14-cv-22965 | Rita Rael v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                                      |
| 2:14-cv-22990 | Regina Taylor v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:14-cv-23058 | Carolyn Rehkop v. Ethicon Inc; Johnson & Johnson                                 |
| 2:14-cv-23546 | Sandra M. Newton and Gerald Newton v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson            |
| 2:14-cv-23582 | Karen Allen v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:14-cv-23645 | Judy Efting v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:14-cv-29717 | Rita Dececco v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:14-cv-29782 | Rhona Lockshin and Stanley M. Lockshin v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:14-cv-29823 | Carolyn Townsend Siler v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:14-cv-29875 | Dola Carter v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:14-cv-29892 | Veronica Quina and Andrew Walter Quina v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson        |
| 2:14-cv-29900 | Mary Fiordelisi and Theodore Fiordelisi v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson       |
| 2:14-cv-30257 | Stacey Carpenter and Jose Chavez v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson              |
| 2:14-cv-31359 | Lisa Dodson v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                   |
| 2:14-cv-31393 | Raymona Tanner v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:14-cv-31439 | Rebecca Ann Stoltz v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:14-cv-31462 | Linda Yeaple v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                  |
| 2:14-cv-31467 | Ella Lerud and Robert L. Lerud v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                |
| 2:14-cv-31500 | Sara Hays v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                     |
| 2:15-cv-07945 | Patricia Hammond v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-07992 | Alese Burnside v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:15-cv-08071 | Teresa A. Weeks v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:15-cv-08097 | Dana Bowen and Randi Arthur Bowen v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson             |
| 2:15-cv-08459 | Lena Gogovska v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                                |
| 2:15-cv-08511 | Barbara Varnadore Hughes v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                     |
| 2:15-cv-08645 | Mary N. Spilsbury, deceased v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                  |
| 2:15-cv-08704 | Margaret Gray Brandt v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                         |
| 2:15-cv-08743 | JoAnn Colvin Ayers v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                           |
| 2:15-cv-08814 | Patricia Ann Wright Nyberg v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                   |
| 2:15-cv-08901 | Sharon M. Hagan Hall v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                         |
| 2:15-cv-09209 | Marcelle Timmons v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                             |
| 2:15-cv-09298 | Gloria Wester Frye Sutton v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                    |
| 2:15-cv-10198 | Rhonda Karen Leggett Hasenauer v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.               |
| 2:15-cv-10446 | Stephanie Jillian Watson v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                     |
| 2:15-cv-14027 | Dina Gause and Patrick Gause v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                 |
| 2:15-cv-14035 | Margaret E. Duley and Clayton Duley v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.          |
| 2:15-cv-14047 | Hildegard Mileusnic v. Johnson & Johnson; Ethicon, Inc.                          |
| 2:15-cv-14640 | Caroline Draughn and Julius Draughn v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson          |

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| 2:15-cv-14809 | Annie Williams and Harvey Williams v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                          |
| 2:15-cv-14896 | Judy Gentry and Gary W. Gentry v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:15-cv-14953 | Betty Mintz and William Mintz v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:15-cv-15238 | Patricia Blackburn v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:15-cv-15884 | Sandra Swafford and Michael Swafford v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:15-cv-16011 | Arlene J. Welle and Daniel M. Welle v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                         |
| 2:15-cv-16084 | Christi Farmer and David Farmer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:15-cv-16233 | Ginger Holden v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-01150 | Trudy Stewart v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-01437 | Jennifer Frost and William Frost v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:16-cv-01439 | Sharon D. Graham v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-01654 | Carmen Robinson and Thomas Robinson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                         |
| 2:16-cv-01891 | Judy Filetti and John Filetti v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                                |
| 2:16-cv-02565 | Mary Kovacs v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-03858 | Leslie Hackler v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-04170 | Barbara Meschino Personal Representative of Barbara Barnett v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:16-cv-04173 | Sandra Stetz-Desmarais and Ron Desmarais v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:16-cv-04565 | Terry Lee Bolt and Ulous Bolt v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:16-cv-04638 | Theresa G. York and Michael York v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                            |
| 2:16-cv-04693 | Anita M. Stanger and William Stanger v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:16-cv-04933 | Maria Hernandez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-05379 | Mary Lutringer v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-05437 | Alice Lee v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-05465 | Judith Zielinski v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-05473 | Sharon Piner v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-05585 | Denise Morneau v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-05786 | Helia Gillaspy v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-05918 | Carol Porter and Seldon Porter v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                              |
| 2:16-cv-06127 | Daisy M. Sarol and J.R. Sarol v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                               |
| 2:16-cv-06575 | Leona Robinson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-06652 | Amy C. Thomas and Donald Thomas v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                             |
| 2:16-cv-06937 | Jennie Auliye v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-07941 | Ruby Malchow v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-08198 | Nancy Martin v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson  |
| 2:16-cv-08426 | Lillie D. Riley v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson   |
| 2:16-cv-08648 | Patricia Pratt and Dennis Clarence Pratt v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:16-cv-08753 | Merlene Jennings and Grover Jennings v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                        |
| 2:16-cv-09453 | Susan Faye Stoops v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.   |
| 2:16-cv-09737 | Rosalee Rae Lindner v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.   |
| 2:16-cv-09756 | Brenda Jo Saxe v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.  |
| 2:16-cv-10107 | Delores Basham v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.  |
| 2:16-cv-10194 | Tonya Prater v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.  |
| 2:16-cv-10376 | Sheila H. Hunnicutt v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.   |
| 2:16-cv-10560 | Ida Stewart-Anliker v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.   |

|               |   |
|---------------|---|
| 2:16-cv-10565 | Joanne Turano v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.                   |
| 2:16-cv-10639 | Alice Warren v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.                    |
| 2:16-cv-10741 | Willa Wilson v. Johnson & Johnson, Ethicon, Inc.                    |
| 2:16-cv-10843 | Mary Lois Moore v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:16-cv-10922 | Sheila Keith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:16-cv-11059 | Elizabeth Gendys Rodriguez v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson      |
| 2:16-cv-11223 | LeGenia S. Dillingham v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson           |
| 2:16-cv-11287 | Lorraine M. Karmonocky v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson          |
| 2:16-cv-11429 | Mary Jackson v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:16-cv-11451 | Roletta Smith v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:16-cv-11529 | Adile Tsanadis v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:16-cv-11595 | Marisela Garcia v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:16-cv-11641 | Irma Belfiglio v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |
| 2:16-cv-11737 | Maritza Salas v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                   |
| 2:16-cv-12206 | Luisa Jordan v. Ethicon, Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:17-cv-00016 | Tanya Bradley v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:17-cv-00041 | Jo Vasquez v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                       |
| 2:17-cv-02069 | Jennifer Long v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                    |
| 2:17-cv-02318 | Bertha Howard and Joyce Loukinas v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson |
| 2:17-cv-02680 | Norma Jensen v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                     |
| 2:17-cv-02722 | Catherine Morris v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                 |
| 2:17-cv-03027 | Debbie K. Dison v. Ethicon Inc.; Johnson & Johnson                  |